

Edward Leahy  
The Pros and Cons of Carnegie's Businesses  
U.S. History  
Massachusetts

**Objectives:**

Students will determine to what extent the beneficial elements of businesses run by Andrew Carnegie compare to the negative aspects

**Materials:**

- Computer with internet access
- Google Slide Software
- Primary Source documents including those from the University of Pittsburgh archive

**Favorable to Carnegie**

- <https://carnegieendowment.org>
- <https://www.carnegiehall.org/Blog/2016/12/Andrew-Carnegie-Building-Peace>
- <https://www.estateplanningspecialists.com/blog/2016/july/the-andrew-carnegie-example>

**Talking Points**

- “By his death in 1919, Carnegie had given away roughly \$350 million of his wealth in philanthropic endeavors, and the remaining \$30 million was given to foundations and charities.
- Students can check here for the history of the World Peace Endowment as well as other causes up to current events
- These are just a few of the sites I was able to find. Students can use their resources but are also encouraged to research their own.

**Unfavorable to Carnegie**

- Andrew Carnegie and the Great Philanthropic Misunderstanding  
<https://www.ntu.ac.uk/about-us/news/news-articles/2021/03/expert-blog-andrew-carnegie-and-the-great-philanthropic-misunderstanding>

- U.S. Homestead Steel workers strike to protect unions and wages, 1892  
<https://nvdatabase.swarthmore.edu/content/us-homestead-steel-workers-strike-protect-unions-and-wages-1892>

### **Procedure:**

Students will look at various primary source documents (links above and their own research) of first hand accounts of material that supports two causes: the good and the bad elements of the iron, steel, and coke industry known as steel mills in the late 1800's.

Students will utilize a rating scale (0-10) for each cause and determine in their own opinion the value (good or bad) of that offering. A rating of ten would be the highest score per example, likewise, a rating of ten on unfavorable matters (such as wages) would be the highest negative rating.

Students will comment on each rating for each category as to why they gave it the rating they did

Students will share their results in a slide presentation format for the class to observe. Students will share their ratings and why they gave it the score they did (students will rate each positive and negative aspect (at least 5 of each) and subtract the negative from the positive ratings. Each score will be tallied and shared.

Final tallies will be shared and data from each presentation will be shown in graph format by the teacher

### **Evaluation**

Students will be evaluated formally and informally on presentation rubric as well as accurately accruing information from primary sources

Participation- students will share and be expected to comment according to rubric and be part of healthy discussions on other presentations as to ratings and rationales.